The Humanization of International Law

by

Theodor Meron
# Table of Contents

**Acknowledgements**  
xiii

**Introduction**  
xv

**Chapter 1: The Humanization of the Law of War**  
A. Introduction and General Principles  
B. From an Inter-State to an Individual Rights Perspective: Reciprocity and Reprisals  
C. The Martens Clause, Principles of Humanity, and Dictates of Public Conscience  
   I. The Origins of the Clause  
   II. The Modernization of the Clause  
   III. The Clause and General Principles  
   IV. The Clause and Public Conscience  
   V. The Clause and the Nuclear Weapons Opinion  
   VI. The Current Significance of the Clause  
D. Applicability of International Humanitarian Law  
   I. The Thresholds of Applicability of Humanitarian Law  
   II. Personal Applicability of Humanitarian Law Treaties: Redefining “Protected Persons”  
E. Protection of Victims  
   I. Individual Rights and Duties and the Inalienability of Rights  
   II. Repatriation of Prisoners of War and Personal Autonomy  
   III. Convergence of Protection under Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law  
   IV. Application of Humanitarian Law by Human Rights Organs  
   V. Application of Human Rights Treaties in Humanitarian Law Contexts  
   VI. Minimum Humanitarian Standards: Fundamental Standards of Humanity  
F. Means and Methods of Warfare and Protection of Combatants  
   I. The Principle of Proportionality
II. Weapons of a Nature to Cause Unnecessary Suffering or to be Inherently Indiscriminate
   a) Weapons of a Nature to Cause Unnecessary Suffering
   b) Weapons that are Inherently Indiscriminate
   c) The Regulation of Weapons Causing Unnecessary Suffering and of Indiscriminate Weapons
   d) Anti-Personnel Land Mines
   e) Laser Weapons
H. Limitations to Laws’ Effectiveness

Chapter 2: Criminalization of Violations of International Humanitarian Law
A. Introduction
B. Crimes against Humanity
C. The Yugoslavia and Rwanda Statutes’ Provisions on Internal Atrocities and the Tension between the Nullum Crimen Principle and Customary Law
D. Criminality of Violations of Humanitarian Law
E. Universality of Jurisdiction
F. Non-Grave Breaches and Universal Jurisdiction
G. War Crimes and Universal Jurisdiction
H. War Crimes and Internal Conflicts
I. The Challenges Facing the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
J. The International Criminal Court
K. Due Process of Law
L. Judicial Independence and Impartiality in International Criminal Tribunals
   I. The Setting
      a) The Role of Judicial Independence
      b) Ensuring Judicial Independence
   II. International Courts
      a) Selection of Judges
      b) The Role of the ICTY President
      c) When Judges Should Recuse Themselves
      d) The Courts and the Public
M. The Contribution Made by International Criminal Tribunals to the Effectiveness of International Law
N. War Crimes Law Comes of Age

Chapter 3: The Law of Treaties
A. Normative and Multilateral Treaties
B. Interpretation of Treaties
C. Jus Cogens and Invalidity of Treaties
D. Termination of Treaties
Table of Contents ix

I. Withdrawal and Denunciation 208
II. Material Breach 209
E. Succession to Treaties 211
F. Reservations to Multilateral Treaties 218
   I. From the Unanimity Rule to the “Object and Purpose” Test 218
   II. Appropriateness of the Vienna Regime on Reservations for Human Rights Treaties 224
   III. Admissibility of Reservations to Normative Treaties 227
      a) Reservations to Customary Law 228
      b) Reservations to Peremptory Norms and to Non-Derogable Provisions 232
      c) Severability 234
IV. Reservations to Remedies and Procedural Provisions, and Competence of Human Rights Bodies to Assess Admissibility of Reservations 241

Chapter 4: Humanization of State Responsibility: From Bilateralism to Community Concerns 247

A. Origin of State Responsibility 247
B. Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness: Distress, Necessity, Consent 251
C. Differentiation of Norms 256
   I. Erga omnes Obligations 256
   II. International Crimes 265
D. Rights and Remedies 270
   I. Departure from State-Centric Enforcement 270
   II. Injured States 272
   III. Legal Standing 275
   IV. Choice of Remedies 281
E. Countermeasures 287
   I. The Right to Take Countermeasures 288
   II. Limitations on Countermeasures 293
   III. Countermeasures and Settlement of Disputes 300
F. Diplomatic Protection 301

Chapter 5: Subjects of International Law 307

A. The State 307
   I. Recognition of States 307
   II. Admission to International Organizations 310
   III. Recognition of Governments 313
B. Non-State Actors 314
   I. The Individual as Subject of International Law 314
   II. Individual Access to International Organs and Institutions 319
      a) Trade Organizations Dispute Settlement Mechanisms 319
         i) The World Trade Organization (WTO) 319
         ii) North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) 321
b) Investment Treaties and ICSID 324

c) World Bank Inspection Panel 327

d) International Tribunals 329

 i) International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea 329
 ii) The European Court of Justice and Court of First Instance 332

e) International Claims Tribunals 335

 i) Iran-United States Claims Tribunal 335
 ii) The United Nations Compensation Commission 337

f) Human Rights Monitoring Bodies 339

III. Non-Governmental Organizations 344

 a) Role of NGOs in Law-making and Standard-setting Activities 344

 b) NGO access to International Institutions 348

IV. Indigenous Peoples 349

C. Conclusions 352

Chapter 6: Sources of International Law 357

A. State Practice and Opinio Juris 360

I. State Practice 360

II. Opinio Juris 366

III. Inconsistent Practice 371

IV. Persistent Objector 374

B. Relationship Between Custom and Treaty 376

C. General Principles of Law 383

D. International Organizations and Sources of International Law 387

I. Resolutions and Declarations as Instances of State Practice 388

II. Role of NGOs 390

E. Peremptory Rules 392

I. The Acceptance of Jus Cogens 392

II. Sources of Peremptory Rules 394

III. Extension of the Concept of Jus Cogens beyond Law of Treaties 396

F. Revival of Customary Humanitarian Law 398

I. Modern Customary Law as Applied by Non-Criminal Tribunals 400

II. The ICTY's Conservative Approach to Customary Law 404

III. Approaches of Other International Criminal Tribunals 416

Concluding Observations 421

Chapter 7: International Courts 425

A. The International Court of Justice 425

B. The European Court of Human Rights 440

I. Character of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 442

II. Reservations 443

III. Interpretation of Treaties 444
Table of Contents

IV. State Sovereignty, Consent to the Convention and Admission to the Council of Europe 446
V. Protection of the Environment 446
   a) A Right to a Healthy Environment 447
   b) Environmental Quality and the Protection of Existing Human Rights.
      i) Respect of Private Life, Home and Property 451
      ii) The Right to Life 454
      iii) Right to Information and Participation in Decision-Making 456
      iv) Access to Remedies 458
      v) Indigenous Rights 459
VI. State Responsibility: *Erga Omnes* Obligations 461
VII. State Responsibility: Diplomatic Protection 462
VIII. Responsibility and Territoriality 462
IX. State Responsibility for Non-Governmental Acts and Imputability (*Drittwirkung*) 466
X. International Humanitarian Law: Application of the Principle of Proportionality and Limits to Collateral Damage 470

Chapter 8: UN Institutions and the Protection of Human Rights 473
A. Human Rights, Development and Financial Institutions 475
   I. Approaches to Development Issues 476
      a) Right to Development 476
      b) Sustainable Development 477
   II. Human Rights and International Financial Institutions 478
B. Human Rights and the United Nations Practice under the Charter 483
   I. Human Rights and Peacekeeping Operations 483
   II. Promotion of Democracy, Election Monitoring and Nation Building 486
      a) Normative Standards 486
      b) Practice 492
   III. Humanitarian and Human Rights Factors in Sanctions 497
      a) Humanitarian Exemptions 502
      b) Application of Humanitarian Law to Sanctions Programs 507
IV. Multilateral Intervention 509
      a) Humanitarian Assistance 509
      b) Interventions under Security Council Resolutions 510
      c) Other Multilateral Interventions 517
      d) Rhetoric and Reality 526

Index 527
Next to the process of 'humanization' of international law, the appeal of jus cogens can be explained from the international lawyer's desire for a single and coherent system of law, including a more clearly established hierarchy of norms. This aspiration is primarily infused by the concern for 'fragmentation' of international law. However, as in the case of humanization, countervailing factors prevent a further expansion of jus cogens in international law. For one thing, jus cogens, belonging to the realm of general international law, is too coarse and inflexible to be The humanization of public international law under the impact of human rights has shifted its focus above all from State-centered to individual-centered. A human rights scholar must resist the urge to present a triumphalist view of the impact human rights have had on all the rest of international law. In this chapter, I focus on the humanization of the law of war, a process to a large extent driven by human rights and principles of humanity. The subject is vast. It is inevitable that major issues must be left out of my discussion.