

History 982- Interdisciplinary Graduate Seminar on "Narrating Native Histories in the Americas"

Spring 2005

Florencia E. Mallon, Professor of History
Alcida Rita Ramos, Tinker Visiting Professor

Course Description:

In the past generation, indigenous and first-people movements for sovereignty and cultural recognition have become a part of political debate in many parts of the world. Since the early 1970s, when Native activists from the Americas joined their brothers and sisters from other continents in helping to reformulate the UN agenda for indigenous peoples' rights as a part of international human rights, indigenous demands for political and cultural recognition have generated a series of strong, identity-based Native movements that have challenged the integrationist policies of nation-states. As a part of this new political and cultural dynamism, Native peoples have also begun to generate their own intellectuals who have taken center stage in debates over cultural interpretation and translation, and over the narration of Native histories. In such a context, the intellectual agency of Native peoples themselves has been placed squarely on the agenda of all research and writing about and with indigenous societies. Scholars working on and collaborating with Native societies, whether themselves Native or non-Native, have therefore been challenged to rethink the ethical, methodological, and conceptual frameworks within which we locate our work on questions of Native histories and cultures.

Yet despite these challenges, how far have we really gone in changing the way indigenous histories are gathered, recorded, and told? In dialogue with the conference of the same name being held on the Madison campus April 7-10, this seminar will address this question from a variety of points of view and of locations within the Americas. We will examine all readings and their authors in methodological, geographical, historical, and epistemological context. Ultimately, our goal will be to consider the ethical and methodological implications of researching and writing about Native cultures, and to help formulate and foster appropriate forms of research, discussion and debate that take into account the sensibilities and knowledge that are a part of the Native cultures and societies being studied and analyzed.

Course Requirements:

- 1) Active participation in class. The core of our work in the course will be reading and discussion of abundant materials. Taking the time and energy to contribute to class discussion, whether with a comment, question, doubt, or criticism, is a crucial component of this. Active participation does not always mean speaking a lot, but it does mean listening to and engaging other people's ideas and comments, and being willing to risk asking a "stupid" question in order to move the discussion forward. The seminar's success depends on it!
- 2) Three short review essays (7-10 pp.), designed to explore more fully the common and additional readings assigned in a particular week. The students responsible for the review in each week will also get together and prepare a short presentation of no more than 15 minutes

on how the additional articles read for the week relate to the assigned common book. The review essays will be due no later than two weeks after the discussion of the topic on which they are based, with the obvious exception of the last two weeks of class and two weeks before Spring Break; you must all choose one of your topics from at least two of the three units in the class. Please hand in two copies so that both professors can read and comment separately.

3) Those not writing review essays in a particular week will write a 2-paragraph comment on the common reading to be discussed that week, and post it on our class email list by noon the Wednesday before class.

4) Your attendance at the April 7-10 conference will also be required.

4) Grading: Class participation: 40%
Review Essays: 20% each

SCHEDULE OF CLASS MEETINGS AND READINGS:

Thursday, Jan. 20- Organizational Meeting

UNIT I- Indigenous Revitalization, Activist Anthropology, and The Politics of Narrative

Thursday, Jan. 27- Kay B. Warren, Indigenous Movements and Their Critics: Pan-Maya Activism in Guatemala (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1998).

- Myriam Jimeno, Juan Gregorio Palechor, "Tierra, identidad y recreación étnica," Journal of Latin American Anthropology 1(2), 1996, pp. 46-77.
- Andrew Orta, "Remembering the Ayllu, Remaking the Nation: Indigenous Scholarship and Activism in the Bolivian Andes," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 6(1), 2001, pp. 198-201.
- María Eugenia Choque and Carlos Mamani, Taller de Historia Oral Andina, "Constitución del ayllu y derechos de los pueblos indígenas: el movimiento indio en los Andes de Bolivia," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 6(1), 2001, pp. 202-224.

Thursday, February 3- Alcida Rita Ramos, Sanumá Memories: Yanomami Ethnography in Times of Crisis (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1995).

- A. Ramos, Indigenism: Ethnic Politics in Brazil (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1998), Part II: Speaking to the Whiteman, pp. 89-144.
- Jean Jackson, "The Impact of Recent National Legislation in the Vaupés Region of Colombia," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 1(2), 1996, pp. 120-151.
- Suzanne Oakdale, "The culture-conscious Brazilian Indian: Representing and reworking Indianness in Kayabi political discourse," American Ethnologist, Vol. 31, No. 1, 2004, pp. 60-75.

Thursday, February 10- Lynn Stephen, iZapata Lives! Histories and Cultural Politics in Southern Mexico (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002).

- Elicura Chihuailaf, Recado confidencial a los chilenos (Santiago: LOM Ediciones, 1999), pp. 159-214.

- Alcida Rita Ramos, "Anthropologist as a political actor," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 4(2)- 5(1), 1999-2000, pp. 172-189.
- Emma Cervone, "Los desafíos de la etnicidad: Las luchas del movimiento indígena en la modernidad", Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 4(1), 1999, pp. 46-73.
- Rosalva Aída Hernández Castillo, "Construyendo la utopía: Esperanzas y desafíos de las mujeres chiapanecas de frente al siglo XXI," Hernández Castillo, coord., La otra palabra: Mujeres y violencia en Chiapas, antes y después de Acteal (México, D.F.: CIESAS, 1998), pp. 125-142.

Thursday, February 17- Rosa Isolde Reuque Paillalef, When a Flower Is Reborn: The Life and Times of a Mapuche Feminist, edited and translated by Florencia E. Mallon (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2002).

- Rosamel Millaman Reinao, "Review of *When a Flower Is Reborn*," American Anthropologist, Vol. 106, No. 3 (September 2004), pp. 629-630.
- Andrea Aravena, "La identidad indígena en los medios urbanos: Procesos de recomposición de la identidad étnica mapuche en la ciudad de Santiago," Guillaume Boccara and Sylvia Galindo (eds.), Lógica mestiza en América (Temuco: Instituto de Estudios Indígenas, 1999), pp. 165-199.
- Víctor Montejo, "The Multiplicity of Mayan Voices: Mayan Leadership and the Politics of Self-Presentation," Kay B. Warren and Jean E. Jackson (eds.), Indigenous Movements, Self-Representation, and the State in Latin America (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2002), pp. 123-48.
- "Mujeres indias, derecho y tradición (Síntesis de las memorias del encuentro-taller: Los derechos de las mujeres en nuestras costumbres y tradiciones, San Cristóbal de las Casas, 19 y 29 de mayo, 1994)," Rosa Rojas (comp.), Chiapas, ¿Y las mujeres qué? (México, D.F.: Ediciones La Correa Feminista, 1994), pp. 177-189.
- Matilde Pérez U. y Laura Castellanos, 'No nos dejen solas': Entrevista con la comandanta Ramona," Rosa Rojas (comp.), Chiapas, ¿Y las mujeres qué?, pp. 26-40.

Thursday, February 24- Víctor Montejo, Voices from Exile: Violence and Survival in Modern Maya History (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1999).

- Pau Pérez-Sales, Roberta Bacic Herzfeld and Teresa Durán Pérez, Muerte y Desaparición Forzada en la Araucanía: Una Aproximación Étnica, Ediciones Universidad Católica de Temuco (Santiago: LOM Editores, 1998), pp. 7-78.
- Memorias Recientes de mi Pueblo, 1973-1990: Araucanía, Roberta Bacic Herzfeld, Teresa Durán Pérez, Roberto Arroyo Ríos, and Pau Pérez Sales (autores) (Temuco: Centro de Estudios Socio Culturales, 1997), pp. 9-60.

UNIT II- Ethnohistory, Orality, and Textuality in Indigenous Memory and History

Thursday, March 3- Joanne Rappaport, Cumbe Reborn: An Andean Ethnography of History (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1994).

- Jean E. Jackson, "Contested Discourses of Authority in Colombian National Indigenous Politics: The 1996 Summer Takeovers," Warren and Jackson (eds.), Indigenous Movements, pp. 81-122.

- David D. Gow and Joanne Rappaort, "The Indigenous Public Voice: The Multiple Idioms of Modernity in Native Cauca," Warren and Jackson (eds.), Indigenous Movements, pp. 47-80.
- Terence Turner, "An Indigenous People's Struggle for Socially Equitable and Ecologically Sustainable Production: The Kayapo Revolt Against Extractivism," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 1(1), 1995, pp. 98-121.

Thursday, March 10- Stéfano Varese, Salt of the Mountain: Campa Asháninka History and Resistance in the Peruvian Jungle (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2002); orig. Sp. ed. 1970.

- Nelly Arvelo-Jimenez and Horacio Biord, "The Impacts of Conquest on Contemporary Indigenous Peoples of the Guiana Shield: The System of Orinoco Regional Interdependence," Anna Roosevelt, ed., Amazonian Indians from Prehistory to the Present: Anthropological Perspectives (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1996), pp. 55-78.
- Bruce Albert, "O ouro canibal e a queda do céu: Uma crítica xamânica da economia política da natureza (Yanomami)," B. Albert & A. Ramos, eds., Pacificando o Branco: Cosmologias do Contato no Norte-Amazônico (São Paulo: Editora Unesp,), pp. 239-274.
- Terence Turner, "Representation, Polyphony, and the Construction of Power in a Kayapó Video," Warren and Jackson (eds.), Indigenous Movements, pp. 229-250.

Thursday, March 17- Thomas A. Abercrombie, Pathways of Memory and Power: Ethnography and History Among an Andean People (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1998, pp. xv-314, 408-422. **Please note: given the unusual length and complexity of this book, the common reading will leave out Part Three except for the conclusion. However, people are encouraged to finish the book if possible, and Part Three, as you can see below, will be read and reported on by the reviewers.**

- Abercrombie, Pathways of Memory and Power, pp. 315-407.
- Steve J. Stern, "Paradigms of Conquest: History, Historiography, and Politics," Prologue to the Second Edition of Peru's Indian Peoples and the Challenge of Spanish Conquest: Huamanga to 1640 (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1993), pp. xxi-liii.

SPRING BREAK, March 19-27

UNIT III- Indigenous Peoples and the Nation-State: Memory, Citizenship, and Identity

Thursday, March 31- Rudolfo A. Anaya and Francisco A. Lomeli, Aztlán: Essays on the Chicano Homeland (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press), 1991 Paperback reprint edition.

- Axel Lazzari, "Aboriginal Recognition, Freedom, and Phantoms: The Vanishing of the Ranquel and the Return of the Rankülche in La Pampa," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 8(3), 2003, pp. 59-83.
- Guillaume Boccara, "Rethinking the Margins/Thinking from the Margins: Culture, Power, and Place on the Frontiers of the New World," Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power, Vol. 10 (2003), pp. 59-81.

- Devon A. Mihesuah, "Introduction," in Mihesuah (ed.), Natives and Academics: Researching and Writing about American Indians (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1998), pp. 1-22.

Thursday, April 7- Noenoe K. Silva, Aloha Betrayed: Native Hawaiian Resistance to American Colonialism (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004).

- Jocelyn Linnekin, "Indigenous Sovereignty Scenarios in Latin America and Hawaii: Parallels and Possibilities," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 1(2), 1996, pp. 152-165.
- Carmen Martínez Novo, "'We Are Against the Government, Although We Are the Government': State Institutions and Indigenous Migrants in Baja California in the 1990s," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 9(2), 2004, pp. 352-381.
- João Pacheco de Oliveira, "Entering and Leaving the 'Melting Pot': A History of Brazilian Indians in the National Censuses," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 4(2)-5(1), 1999-2000, pp. 190-211.

PARTICIPATION IN OUR CONFERENCE

Thursday, April 14- Greg Grandin, The Blood of Guatemala: A History of Race and Nation (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000).

- Antonio Escobar Ohmstede, "La estructura agraria en las Huastecas, 1880-1915," Escobar O. and Teresa Rojas Rabiela (coord.), Estructuras y formas agrarias en México, del pasado y del presente (México, D.F.: Registro Nacional Agrario/ Archivo General Agrario/ CIESAS, 2001), pp. 179-196.
- Emilio H. Kourí, "Economía y comunidad en Papantla: Reflexiones sobre 'la cuestión de la tierra' en el siglo XIX," Escobar and Rojas (coord.), Estructuras y formas agrarias en México, pp. 199-214.
- Peter Guardino, "'Toda libertad para emitir sus votos': Plebeyos, campesinos y elecciones en Oaxaca, 1808-1850," Cuadernos del Sur, año 6, núm. 15, junio 2000, pp. 87-114.

Thursday, April 21- Marisol de la Cadena, Indigenous Mestizos: The Politics of Race and Culture in Cuzco, Peru, 1919-1991 (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000).

- Les Field, "Blood and Traits: Preliminary Observations on the Analysis of Mestizo and Indigenous Identities in Latin America vs. the U.S.," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 7(1), 2002, pp. 2-33.
- Florencia E. Mallon, "Constructing *Mestizaje* in Latin America: Authenticity, Marginality and Gender in the Claiming of Ethnic Identities," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 2 (1), 1996, pp. 170-181.
- James Clifford, "Identity in Mashpee," in Clifford, The Predicament of Culture: Twentieth-Century Ethnography, Literature, and Art (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988), pp. 277-346.

Thursday, April 28- Charles R. Hale, Resistance and Contradiction: Miskitu Indians and the Nicaraguan State, 1894-1987 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1994).

- Rosa Rojas y Ximena Bedregal, "Feminismo y luchas indígenas: Diálogo con Myrna Cunningham, Líder Miskita," Rosa Rojas (comp.), Chiapas, ¿Y las mujeres qué?, pp. 80-89.

- Les W. Field, "State, Anti-state, and Indigenous Entities: Reflections upon a Páez *Resguardo* and the New Colombian Constitution," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 1(2), 1996, pp. 98-119.
- Aracy Lopes da Silva, "The Akwe-Xavante in History at the End of the 20th Century," Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 4(2)-5(1), 1999-2000, pp. 212-237.
- Alcida Rita Ramos, "Disengaging Ethnography," in Deborah Poole (ed.), The Blackwell Companion to Latin American Anthropology, 2005, forthcoming, ms.

Thursday, May 5- Florencia E. Mallon, Courage Tastes of Blood: The Mapuche Indigenous Community of Nicolás Ailfo and the Chilean State, 1906-2001 (Durham: Duke University Press, 2005). **Please note: the book will be in page proofs and will be photocopied at the appropriate time.**

- Claudia Briones, "Re-membering the dis-membered: A drama about Mapuche and anthropological cultural production in three scenes (4th Edition)," The Journal of Latin American Anthropology, 8(3), 2003, pp. 31-58.
- Guillaume Boccara, "The Mapuche People in Post-Dictatorship Chile," Études rurales, Nos. 163-164 (July-December 2002), pp. 283-304.
- Donald L. Fixico, "Ethics and Responsibilities in Writing American Indian History," in Mihesuah (ed.), Natives and Academics: Researching and Writing about American Indians (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1998), pp. 84-99.
- Elizabeth Cook-Lynn, "American Indian Intellectualism and the New Indian Story," in Mihesuah (ed.), Natives and Academics: Researching and Writing about American Indians (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1998), pp. 111-138.

Roderic Ai Camp, "Indigenous Movements and Their Critics, Pan-Maya Activism in Guatemala. Kay B. Warren ," The Journal of Politics 62, no. 2 (May, 2000): 622-623. <https://doi.org/10.1086/jop.62.2.2647712>. MOST READ. Of all published articles, the following were the most read within the past 12 months. The Parties in Our Heads: Misperceptions about Party Composition and Their Consequences. Ahler et al. Voter Identification Laws and the Suppression of Minority Votes. Hajnal et al. Political Homophily in Social Relationships: Evidence from Online Dating Behavior. Huber et al. Evaluating After the Violencia: Indigenous Activism & Kay Warren & Indigenous Movements and their Critics: Pan Mayan Activism in Guatemala (1998) Guatemala is a multinational society! That is to say "Guatemalan Culture"™ cannot be other than a confederation of cultures and languages in which each preserves its originality (Cojti Cuxil, in Kay Warren, 1995). Ideological contradictions between the left and the Mayan movement: " Ethnicity versus class struggle Pan Mayan Movement " Elements of Maya culture utilized to inform the construction of pan-Mayan politics -traditional, pre-conquest " How pan-Mayanism The Pan-Mayan Movement is an ethno-political movement among the Maya peoples of Guatemala and Mexico. The movement emerged in the late 1980s and early 1990s in response to a long tradition of the political marginalization of the large indigenous population of Guatemala, and particularly in response to the violent counter-insurgency policies that disproportionately affected indigenous communities during the Guatemalan Civil War. The movement was organized around an ideology seeking to unite the